



Republika ng Pilipinas  
**PANGASIWAAN NG TUBIG AT ALKANTARILYA SA KALAKHANG MAYNILA**  
Metropolitan Waterworks and Sewerage System  
**REGULATORY OFFICE**  
Katipunan Road, Balara, Quezon City 1105, Philippines

**BIDS AND AWARDS COMMITTEE (BAC)**

**RESOLUTION NO. 2012-11**  
Series of 2012

**DECLARING ISLA LIPANA & CO. IN JOINT VENTURE WITH  
LAHMEYER IDP CONSULT, INC. AS THE  
HIGHEST RATED BID FOR THE PROCUREMENT OF THE  
2012 RATE REBASING CONSULTANCY SERVICES  
(CONTRACT NO. RO-CS2012-001)**

**WHEREAS**, on 03 April 2012, the MWSS Board of Trustees (BOT) issued Resolution No. 2012-038 approving the Procurement of the 2012 Rate Rebasing Consultancy Services under Contract No. RO-CS2012-001 with an Approved Budget for the Contract (ABC) of Philippine Pesos Sixty One Million Eight Hundred Sixty Thousand Six Hundred (Php 61,860,600.00), Terms of Reference, Shortlisting and Technical Proposal Evaluation Criteria;

**WHEREAS**, on 04 April 2012, the MWSS Regulatory Office Bids and Awards Committee (RO BAC) posted the Request for Expression of Interest (RFEI) in the website of the Philippine Government Electronic Procurement System (PhilGEPS);

**WHEREAS**, on 05 April 2012, RO BAC published the RFEI in the Philippine Star. The RFEI was, likewise, published in the Philippine Daily Inquirer on 08 April 2012;

**WHEREAS**, eight (8) firms signified their interest and bought eligibility documents within the deadline set on 16 April 2012 at 4:00 P.M., namely:

1. Reyes, Tacandong & Co.
2. Gatmaitan & Associates
3. Angel Lazaro & Associates International
4. Punongbayan & Araullo / GTI
5. Manabat Sanagustin & Co. / KPMG
6. Isla Lipana & Co. / Pricewaterhouse Coopers in association with Poyry IDP Consult, Inc.
7. Sustainable Development Solutions
8. Rebel group International BV

**WHEREAS**, only two (2) firms, namely Punongbayan & Araullo / GTI and Isla Lipana & Co. / Pricewaterhouse Coopers in association with Poyry IDP Consult, Inc. submitted eligibility documents;

**WHEREAS**, on 23 April 2012 during the opening of the eligibility documents, Punongbayan & Araullo / GTI was initially declared eligible, subject to a post verification of the eligibility documents;

**WHEREAS**, on 23 April 2012, RO BAC issued Resolution No. 2012-01 declaring Isla Lipana & Co. / Pricewaterhouse Coopers in association with Poyry IDP Consult, Inc. ineligible to bid on the ground that their eligibility documents which were sent electronically or by email were incomplete. The BAC decided not to open the hard copies of their eligibility documents for the reason that the same were submitted after the deadline for the submission of the eligibility documents;

**WHEREAS**, on 25 April 2012, RO BAC issued Resolution No. 2012-02 declaring Punongbayan & Araullo / GTI ineligible to bid upon the review of the Technical Working Group (TWG) of the sufficiency and completeness of Punongbayan & Araullo / GTI's eligibility documents. The TWG, in its memorandum dated 25 April 2012 made certain observations which include among others, the facts that certain documents were not certified by the issuing office, agency or entity as required in the Instruction to Bidders and that only the biodata or curriculum vitae of thirteen (13) of the 28 key personnel or professional staff were submitted;

**WHEREAS**, on 26 April 2012, the RO BAC issued Resolution No. 2012-03 denying the motion/request for reconsideration filed by Isla Lipana & Co. / Pricewaterhouse Coopers in association with Poyry IDP Consult, Inc. since there are no valid reasons to depart from its previous decision and that it cannot open the hard copies of the eligibility documents as requested on the ground that they were filed beyond the deadline for the submission of the same;

**WHEREAS**, on 30 April 2012, the RO BAC issued Resolution No. 2012-04 denying the motion/request for reconsideration filed by Punongbayan & Araullo / GTI on even date by reiterating that certain documents were not certified by the issuing office, agency or entity as required in the Instruction to Bidders and that only the biodata or curriculum vitae of thirteen (13) of the 28 key personnel or professional staff were submitted;

**WHEREAS**, on 03 May 2012, the RO BAC received a second letter from Isla Lipana & Co. / Pricewaterhouse Coopers in association with Poyry IDP Consult, Inc. requesting for reconsideration/clarification but the RO BAC stood pat on its decision;

**WHEREAS**, on 07 May 2012, the RO BAC issued Resolution No. 2012-05 declaring both Isla Lipana & Co. and Punongbayan & Araullo, ineligible to bid;

**WHEREAS**, on 10 May 2012, the Board of Trustees issued Resolution No. 2012-063 approving RO BAC Resolution No. 2012-05 dated 07 May 2012 declaring a FAILURE OF BIDDING and authority to re-advertise the Request for Expression of Interest (RFEI);

**WHEREAS**, on 14 May 2012, RO BAC re-advertised the RFEI in the Philippine Star and likewise reposted in the website of the Philippine Government Electronic Procurement System (PhilGEPS) on even date;

**WHEREAS**, on 30 May 2012 at 2:00 P.M, the set deadline for the submission of expression of interest and procurement of eligibility documents, seven (7) firms signified their interest and bought eligibility documents, namely:

1. Isla Lipana & Co. / Pricewaterhouse Coopers
2. Punongbayan & Araullo
3. Angel Lazaro & Associates International
4. Rebel Group International BV / ACCRA
5. KPMG / Manabat Sanagustin & Co., CPAs
6. Berkman Int'l., Inc. in joint venture with ITAC/
7. Reyes Tacandong & Co.

**WHEREAS**, on 31 May 2012 at 2:00 P.M, the set deadline for the submission and opening of the Eligibility Documents, only five (5) out of seven (7) interested firms submitted their eligibility documents which upon eligibility check resulted in the following declaration by the BAC, to wit:

| <b>FIRM</b>                          | <b>Date/Time of Submission of Eligibility Documents</b> | <b>REMARKS</b>  |
|--------------------------------------|---|---|
| Isla Lipana & Co. / Pricewaterhouse  | 31 May 2012 / 12:39 P.M.                                | Initially found eligible subject to post-verification.  |
| Berkman Int'l., Inc. in JV with ITAC | 31 May 2012 / 1:14 P.M.                                 | BAC withheld decision. TWG was tasked to evaluate and validate documents and submit report by June 5, 2012. |
| Reyes Tacandong & Co.                | 31 May 2012 / 1:25 P.M.                                 | - do -  |
| Angel Lazaro & Associates Int'l.     | 31 May 2012 / 1:28 P.M.                                 | - do -  |
| Punongbayan & Araullo                | 31 May 2012 / 1:28 P.M.                                 | - do -  |

**WHEREAS**, on 01 June 2012, the TWG submitted the result of its evaluation of the eligibility documents of the five (5) interested firms, to wit:

- |   |   |              |
|---|---|--------------|
| 1. Isla Lipana & Co. / Pricewaterhouse Coopers      | - | COMPLIED     |
| 2. Berkman Int'l., Inc. in joint venture with ITAC/ | - | NOT COMPLIED |
| 3. Reyes Tacandong & Co.                            | - | COMPLIED     |
| 4. Angel Lazaro & Associates International          | - | COMPLIED     |
| 5. Punongbayan & Araullo                            | - | COMPLIED     |

**WHEREAS**, on 04-05 June 2012, the TWG conducted a shortlisting evaluation without prejudice to BAC's declaration of Eligibility or Non-Eligibility of interested firms and on 06 June 2012, the TWG submitted the shortlisting evaluation report which resulted to the following:

- |  |   |        |
|--|---|--------|
| 1. Isla Lipana & Co. / Pricewaterhouse Coopers | - | FAILED |
| 2. Reyes Tacandong & Co.                       | - | FAILED |
| 3. Angel Lazaro & Associates International     | - | FAILED |
| 4. Punongbayan & Araullo                       | - | FAILED |

**WHEREAS**, on 07 June 2012, the RO BAC issued Resolution No. 2012-06 initially declaring Isla Lipana & Co., Reyes Tacandong & Co., Angel Lazaro & Associates International, and Punongbayan & Araullo as ELIGIBLE TO BID for the procurement of the 2012 Rate Rebasing Consultancy Services;

**WHEREAS**, also on 07 June 2012, the RO BAC under Resolution No. 2012-07 approving and adopting the TWG recommendation that none of the four (4) eligible bidders met the minimum passing score of 75 points and decided to recommend to the MWSS Board of Trustees a 2<sup>nd</sup> FAILURE OF BIDDING AND TO ADOPT A NEGOTIATED METHOD OF PROCUREMENT.

**WHEREAS**, on 11 June 2012, the RO BAC issued Resolution No. 2012-08 recommending to the MWSS Board of Trustees the AUTHORITY TO NEGOTIATE WITH THE ELIGIBLE BIDDERS AND TO ADOPT THE REVISED TERMS OF REFERENCE AND TECHNICAL PROPOSAL EVALUATION CRITERIA for the 2012 Rate Rebasing Consultancy Services;

**WHEREAS**, on 14 June 2012, the Board of Trustees issued Resolution No. 2012-074 approving and confirming the following:

1. Declaration of a 2<sup>nd</sup> failure of bidding for the procurement of the 2012 Rate Rebasing Consultancy Services under Contract No. RO-CS2012-001;
2. Authorization of the RO BAC to adopt a negotiated method of procurement and to negotiate with the eligible bidders; and
3. Authorization of the RO BAC to adopt the revised Terms of Reference (TOR) and Technical Proposal Evaluation Criteria (TPEC);

**WHEREAS**, on 16 June 2012, the RO BAC posted the Invitation for Negotiated Procurement for 2012 Rate Rebasing Consultancy Services in the website of the Philippine Government Electronic Procurement System (PhilGEPS);

**WHEREAS**, on 26 June 2012, the RO BAC held a pre-bid conference attended by the four (4) pre-qualified bidders;

**WHEREAS**, on 05 July 2012, the RO BAC conducted a debriefing of technical results for pre-qualified bidders;

**WHEREAS**, on 23 July 2012, the deadline for submission of the bid, all four (4) pre-qualified bidders submitted on time their respective eligibility documents and technical proposals;

**WHEREAS**, on the same date, the schedule set for the opening of bids, only the representative of Isla Lipana remained after the submission to witness the opening. It was then decided by the BAC to re-schedule the opening on 25 July 2012 and to inform the other bidders accordingly;

**WHEREAS**, on 25 July 2012, the RO BAC performed the opening of eligibility documents and technical proposals and witnessed by representatives from pre-qualified bidders;


**WHEREAS**, on 02 August 2012, the TWG submitted the Technical Evaluation Report dated 01 August 2012 under the negotiated procurement with the following results:

| Consultants  | Applicable Experience (20 points)              | Approach and Methodology (20 points) | Quality of Key Personnel (60 points) | TOTAL SCORE  | RANK              |
|--|--|--------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|--------------|-------------------|
| Isla Lipana & Co. in JV with Lahmeyer IDP Consult, Inc.                                      | 14.57  | 14.75                                | 55.13                                | <b>84.45</b> | <b>1</b>          |
| Angel Lazaro & Associates International in JV with UPecon Foundation and Navarro Amper & Co. | 9.55   | 17.50                                | 51.95                                | <b>79.00</b> | <b>2</b>          |
| Punongbayan & Araullo in JV with Pertconsult International                                   | 12.57  | 9.25                                 | 50.90                                | <b>72.72</b> | <b>3</b>          |
| Reyes Tacandong & Co.  | <b>DISQUALIFIED (incomplete key personnel)</b> |                                      |                                      |              | <b>Not Ranked</b> |

**WHEREAS**, on 06 August 2012, the BAC deliberated on the TWG Technical Evaluation Report dated 01 August 2012, applying the Board-approved Technical Evaluation Criteria where a technical score of at least 70 points should be earned in order to qualify;

**NOW THEREFORE**, for and in consideration of the foregoing premises, the MWSS RO BAC hereby **RESOLVES**, as it is hereby **RESOLVED** pursuant to the Board-adopted Quality-Based Evaluation Procedure consistent with Section 33.2.1(a) of RA 9184, otherwise known as the Government Procurement Act and its Revised Implementing Rules and Regulations, to declare Isla Lipana & Co. in Joint Venture with Lahmeyer IDP Consult, Inc. as the bidder with the Highest Rated Bid (HRB).

Adopted this 14th day of August 2012.



**RANDOLPH Q. MARCIAL**  
Acting Chairman



**MYLENE JOY S. PARRAS**  
Acting Vice-Chairman



**ROSENDO O. ALEGRE**  
Member

*(on leave)*  
**GUILLERMO O. MENDOZA, JR.**  
Member



**ELIAS R. ROMANO**  
Member/End-User